

Pennsylvania Broadband Development Authority
Board Meeting Minutes
June 1, 2023
60 East Wing Capitol Building & Microsoft Teams Meeting

Board members and voting designees in attendance:

- Secretary Uri Monson, Office of the Budget, Chairman
- Mark Critz on behalf of Secretary Russell Redding, Department of Agriculture
- Dr. David Volkman on behalf of Acting Secretary Khalid Mumin, Department of Education
- Matt Bembenick on behalf of Acting Secretary Reggie McNeil, Department of General Services
- Matt Franchak on behalf of Senator John Kane, Assistant Secretary
- Representative Rob Matzie
- Phil Kirchner on behalf of Representative Carl Walker Metzgar
- Senator Kristin Phillips-Hill, Secretary
- Dr. Kyle Kopko, Center for Rural PA

Designees in attendance:

- Chloe Mandara
- Jon Hopcraft
- Zach Reber
- Dr. Laura Dimino
- Rich Pronesti

Department of Community and Economic Development (DCED) staff in attendance:

- Brandon Carson
- Paul Opiyo
- Kalie Snyder
- Leigh Walter
- Lori Irwin
- Michael Tierney
- Pam Frontino
- Kyle Snyder
- Greg Alliger
- Allison Brubaker
- Sarah Souder
- Greg Welker
- Colin Parry
- Penny Ickes

Guests in attendance:

- Jennifer Keaton, BCAP
- Nicole Ugarte
- Jim Warta, Consolidated Communications
- Sarah Hammond, AFLCIO
- Jamelia Graham, Intern, Rural PA

- Dayli Acosta, Intern, Rural PA
- David Bonside,
- Dave Kerr, AT&T
- Elizabeth Lion Januzzi, Governor's Office
- Patrick Grill, House of Representatives
- Mike Starner, Service Electric Lehigh Valley
- Lawrence Metts Jr., DQE
- Norm Parrish, PA One Call
- Jodie Stuck, Malady Wooten
- Carrie Cleary, Dept. of Education
- Teresa Wills, Legal
- David Ashton, Graybar
- Julie Seeds, Middle Paxton Township
- Chris Taylor, MBI
- Casey Fellingner, Milliron Goodman
- Sheri Collins, CNR
- Gary Wells, Albion Borough
- Mark VanOuse, Zito Media
- Gwen Ross, Workforce Dev.
- Barry Hayman, Potter County
- Evan Rubin, MBI
- Amy Sturges, PML
- Carmen Dawson, Blacks in Technology Foundation
- Mark Rafail, Fayette County
- Betsy Lockwood, SEDA-COG
- Hans Kirchner - IU12
- Remy Pesimo, Zito Media
- John Timney, Washington County Authority
- Michael H Hain, Jackson Broadband
- Michelle Lama, T-Mobile
- Sami Azzouz, Conexon
- Christopher Field, University of Pittsburgh
- Jeanne Shearer, Windstream
- Carl Yastremski, Frontier
- Jennifer Cloonan, Frontier
- Steve Hill, SBCA
- Sara Stringfellow, GMS Funding
- Matt Fine, One Strategies
- Andrew French, Fayette County
- Lisa Anne Davis, PSU
- Harry Crissy, Penn State Extension
- Sam Haulman, Service Electric

- Alex Rahn, Wanner Assoc.
- Lindsey Ringquist, Adams County
- Catharine Conner, Milliron Goodman
- Paige Oliver, Ichor Strategies
- Laura M Grassia, Temple
- Jennifer Lench, DCED
- Courtney Accurti, MBI
- Melissa Gates, County Commissioners Assoc.
- Jocelyn Cramer, Wayne County Commissioner
- Fran Bradley, Breezeline
- Sonny Hunt, Fiber Optic Marketplace
- Tom Beresnyak, PSU
- Thomas Musgrove, All Points Broadband
- Grant Dull, Firstlight Fiber
- Pedro Romero, Verizon
- Kristen Ritchey, Comcast
- Doug Friend, Vitalink
- Steve Schwerbel, WISPA
- Julie Kaylor - Breezeline
- Laura Edinger, PA Utility Law Project
- Dan Huebner, Civis
- Scott Kramer, SEDA-COG
- Brent Jagueneau-Siegel, Ichor Strategies
- Jim Ladlee, PSU
- Amy Maclean, Access Intel
- Kate Rivera, Kate Rivera Solutions
- Julie Schell, E-rate Comcast
- Mark Yuknek, Graybar
- Erin Donohoe, Dept. of Ed.
- Beth Sanner, Conexon
- Elizabeth Waterhouse, Venango Twp
- Shannon Munro, PA College of Technology
- Bill Perkins, ICCN
- Rene Gonzalez, Lit Communities
- Russ McDaid, PA eCommerce Assn
- Curt Kosko, Shentel
- Gerald Mensah, Global Tranz, Big Jet Logistics
- Tim Alexander, AICUP
- Shari Kreitz, Worth Township
- Samantha Chivinski, Schuylkill Chamber of Commerce
- William George Jr., PA House Representatives
- Brian Regli, Governor's Office
- Mikecia Witherspoon, Office of John Fetterman

- Gary Honabach, Bloomsburg School District
- Bailey M. Thumm, Pa Farm Bureau
- Doug Brown, Dauphin County
- Amy Huntington, Exeter Borough
- Mary Beth Wood, WEDCO
- Owen Pucel, Cal U of PA
- Jim Martin, Adams County
- JJ Hrechun, M:7 Agency
- Elizabeth A. Lose, Centre County, Planning &Comm.
- Emme Reiser, PA Assoc. of Realtors
- Julia Koehl, United Way SWPA
- Keith Alan Hall, AGOC
- Anthony Hennen - The Center Square
- Brett Biggica, Saxton & Stump
- Tenderlee Little, McKean Twp
- Matthew Szuchyt, Senate Comm & Tech
- Roberta Farls, Stowe Township
- Kris Anderson, IBEW
- Jeffery Abramowitz, Philadelphia Re-Entry Coalition
- Carol Duffy, Commissioner McKean County
- Scott Dunn, Commissioner Fayette County
- Jim Mercante, Chester County Digital Alliance
- Jessica Sahl, Chester County Intermediate Unit
- Rob Troxell, Upward Broadband
- Carl Marrara, PA Manufacturer's Association
- Richard Muth, IUP
- Jeannette Burwell
- Robert Carl
- Bonnie Cornell
- Cassie Miller
- Shelly OMalia,
- Shirley Anders
- April Brumfield
- Tom Kreiner
- Annie Kalman
- Lord Dowdell
- Michael Zody
- Leslie Grace
- Roy Hoover
- Daniel Carpenter
- Rick Garces
- Brian Rengert
- Karen Connell
- Jackie McCarthy
- Eric Scicchitano
- Jeff Snyder

- Jeanette Henning
- Joseph Taylor
- Craig Yohn
- Chase Custer
- Carrie, Wharton Twp
- Abbie, Muddy Creek Twp
- Wyoming County
- CHRIS S
- Dave
- Florence
- Karen
- Keiran
- Kelly
- Larry
- Liz
- Jim
- Joe
- Sonny
- Stacey
- Gray
- Manager
- Durham Twp
- MK

I. Call to Order

Chairman Monson called the meeting to order at 10:02 AM.

Kalie Snyder conducted a roll call of the board members and confirmed quorum.

II. Approval of April 5, 2023, Meeting Minutes

Chairman Monson asked for questions and comments on the minutes as presented to the Board. Seeing none he asked for a motion to approve the minutes as presented to the Board. Motion made by Matt Franchak. Motion was seconded by Phil Kirchner. Chairman Monson asked for all Board members to approve or deny the motion. Motion passed unanimously.

III. MOU Extension and FY 2023-2024 Estimate of Expenditures

Chairman Monson asked for an update on MOU extension, including staff updates from PBDA Director Carson.

Director Carson stated that the DCED provides operational support to the Authority, including staffing, legal, finance, office space marketing, and IT equipment. The current MOU is due to expire on June 30, 2023. The letter includes a one-year extension to June 30, 2024. The Authority worked with the DCED on an estimate of expenditures. That estimate is \$2,000,040.00 for day-to-day operations over the one-year period.

Carson introduced new staff, Brandon Peters, Deputy Director and Mary Markle, Executive Assistant. The staff complement is set at 11, with 80% being met the Authority will fill the rest of the positions in the next few months and be at full complement for CPF and BEAD implementation.

Director Carson requested action on MOU extension.

Chairman Monson called for a motion to approve extension. Motion made by Matt Franchak. Motion was seconded by Phil Kirchner. Chairman asked for questions and comments on the MOU extension.

Mark Critz, Dept of Agriculture asked why the extension is only one year. Lori Irwin, DCED legal shared that it is typical for an MOU to run one year so it can be reevaluated as additional resources are needed, and you can get a more accurate projection as to the numbers needed.

With no more question Chairman Monson called for all board members to approve or deny the motion. Motions passed unanimously.

IV. Update on Mapping Efforts and FCC Bulk Challenge Submission

Chairman Monson asked Kyle Snyder to present on mapping efforts.

Kyle Snyder, PBDA Planning Specialist presented on the Authority's mapping efforts and the FCC bulk challenge submission. The Authority successfully submitted 50,000 locations as part of a service availability challenge to version 1 of the FCC's national broadband map. Over 21K of those challenges were upheld at the time of the board meeting. Municipalities and other entities can also submit a bulk challenge using the template available on the PBDA website.

Version 2 of the national map which was released on May 30th indicates that Pennsylvania has 20K serviceable locations added to the map of which approximately 9K were unserved.

That indicates a change of over 20K additional locations added to the map, with a positive change of over 8,821 additional unserved locations. This ensures the additional locations are eligible for BEAD funding. Also noted is the important distinction that PA did not lose any unserved locations from version 1 to 2, and that PA is in top 10 states in the country for # of unserved locations.

Using fabric data, the authority continues to work to make sure it has the most accurate maps possible when it comes time for the BEAD state challenge process.

Snyder demonstrated accessibility and functionality of maps, focusing on how to locate unserved and underserved locations. He also noted that the maps are accessible to the public via the PBDA website

Director Carson asked about the process as additional unserved addresses are identified. Kyle responded, as stated earlier, using fabric data we continue to work to make sure we have the most accurate maps possible when it comes time for the BEAD state challenge process.

Director Carson noted that the Authority is working to make both maps public as soon as possible.

V. Update on Five-Year Action Plan and State Digital Equity Plan

Chairman Monson invited Michael Baker International (MBI) to provide the update.

Presentations from MBI were Steven Barber, Project Principal, Kirsten Compitello, Digital Equity Plan Lead, and Beth Crow, Engagement Lead.

Ms. Compitello recognized the rest of the MBI team, subcontractors, and other collaborators; PBDA, PBDA Board, Subcommittees and Core Planning Team. Director Carson added that Kyle Kopko will be the board representative to the core planning team.

Kirsten Compitello reviewed:

- Collaboration- PBDA, PBDA Board, Core Planning Team, Subcommittees
- Schedule – deadlines events and tasks scheduled 6/1-10/31
- Funding implications – BEAD and Digital Equity Act
- Task 1 – Project Management and Engagement
- Task 2 – 5-Year Action Plan
- Task 3 – Digital Equity Plan

Beth Crow reviewed:

- NTIA objectives for Public Engagement
- Four components of Public Engagement
 - Community Conversations
 - Stakeholder roundtables with more focus
 - Thematic Roundtables
 - Surveys and Questionnaires
- Map of Public Engagement
- Time of events (June-August)
- Co-host requirements
- Co-host toolkit

Chairman Monson suggested building in a public comment period in the time between the date for the draft action plan and the Board's consideration of the plan. Ms. Compitello responded that the next step after the completion of the plan is the Initial Proposal which includes a 30-day public comment period.

Dr. Kopko asked if community partners have been identified and if details been solidified for community events anticipated over the next two weeks. Beth Crow responded that nothing is scheduled yet, but that MBI is working on it.

VI. Sub-Committee Updates

Chairman Monson called for subcommittee updates.

Dr. Kyle Kopko - Data and Mapping

Todd Eachus - Technical

Stephanie Perry – Workforce and Supply Chain

Kevin Sunday & Sarah Hammond – Outreach & Education

VII. Public Comment

Chairman Monson asked Kalie Snyder to conduct public comment. Kalie reminded the public of the format to provide comments and asked that they remain under 2 minutes.

Mike Starner from Service Electric expressed concern about the job classifications, prevailing wage and being able to find a large enough workforce in his area and throughout the state.

Jim Mercante from Chester County Digital Alliance asked if there is a maximum or optimal size for community listening session. Would it be possible to have more than one listening session?

Michael Hain, from Jackson Broadband, expressed concern about the grant application deadline and the \$500k minimum requirement.

Pedro Romero from Verizon commented that the application portal has some formatting and attachment limitations and asked if the Authority will evaluate email proposals.

Sam Haulman, from Service Electric, expressed concern about the prevailing wage requirements as well as being able to come up with an accurate cost estimate with the current job classifications.

Casey Fellingner from Milliron & Goodman Government Relations, LLC asked if the FCC map or the Penn State map should be used for the application.

Jennifer Cloonan from Frontier Communications asked which map to use. Are the maps displayed by the Penn State Extension included the refresh of the version 2 maps that were also released. Also, has the character limit in the portal been expanded?

Chris Field from University of Pittsburgh asked if locations are the same as addresses. Chris also suggested that the consultant include in their special interest roundtables, elected officials to review PA statutes that might prohibit or discourage municipalities from being able to sell broadband directly to constituents.

Sherri Kreitz, from Butler County asked if there are community partners in her area. She also asked if someone has declined cable and is using a satellite system or service for their internet would they be in the data as served?

Fran Bradley from Breezeline, expressed concern with the lack of a job classification. Contractors are paid by the foot. The prevailing wage will drive the price up. Would like to see that area addressed and clarified.

Gerald Mensah from Big Jet logistics asked if the board will consider applications from non-traditional broadband providers who have had success with projects in other fields.

Matt Bembenick from the Department of General Services, asked to amend roll call to indicate that the DGS is present.

Carmen Dawson from Blacks in Technology Foundation, offered help with diversity goals across the mapping, planning, or implementation of the expansion.

Catharine Conner from Milliron Goodman, asked which map should be used for the upcoming application process.

VIII. Adjournment

Chairman Monson called for a motion to adjourn. Motion made by Matt Franchak. Motion seconded by Phil Kirchner. Meeting adjourned at 11:34 AM.

Respectfully submitted,
Senator Kristin Phillips-Hill
Secretary